

1 WAYNE C. ARNOLD, State Bar No. 103194
warnold@lurie-zepeda.com
2 CATHERINE M. MCCLEARY, State Bar No. 239333
cmccleary@lurie-zepeda.com
3 LURIE, ZEPEDA, SCHMALZ & HOGAN
A Professional Corporation
4 9107 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 800
Beverly Hills, California 90210-5533
5 PH: (310) 274-8700 FAX: (310) 274-2798

6 Attorneys for Defendant
THRIFTY PAYLESS, INC.
7 dba RITE AID #5616

8
9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
10 SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

11
12 BARBARA HUBBARD,
13 Plaintiffs,

14 v.

15 THRIFTY PAYLESS, INC. dba RITE
16 AID # 5616; RANCHO PALOMAR, LP,
17 Defendants.

Case No. 08 CV 1106 W JMA

**DEFENDANT THRIFTY PAYLESS,
INC. DBA RITE AID # 5616'S
ANSWER TO COMPLAINT**

Action Filed: June 23, 2008
Trial Date: None

18
19 Defendant THRIFTY PAYLESS, INC. dba RITE AID #5616 ("Rite
20 Aid") hereby responds to Plaintiff BARBARA HUBBARD's ("Plaintiff") Complaint
21 as follows:

22 **I. SUMMARY**

23 1. Responding to Paragraph 1 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Rite Aid
24 admits that it is a lessee of a building at 1325 3rd Avenue, Chula Vista, CA 9191.
25 Except so admitted, Rite Aid denies, on information and belief, each and every
26 allegation contained in Paragraph 1 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

27 2. Responding to Paragraph 2 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Rite Aid
28 denies, upon information and belief, each and every allegation contained in Paragraph

1 2 of Plaintiff's Complaint and denies that Plaintiff is entitled to relief as against Rite
2 Aid.

3 **II. JURISDICTION**

4 3. Responding to Paragraph 3 of Plaintiff's Complaint, this is a
5 conclusion of law that is respectfully referred to the Court for determination and as to
6 which no response is required.

7 4. Responding to Paragraph 4 of Plaintiff's Complaint, this is a
8 conclusion of law that is respectfully referred to the Court for determination and as to
9 which no response is required.

10 5. Responding to Paragraph 5 of Plaintiff's Complaint, this is a
11 conclusion of law that is respectfully referred to the Court for determination and as to
12 which no response is required.

13 **III. VENUE**

14 6. Responding to Paragraph 6 of Plaintiff's Complaint, this is a
15 conclusion of law that is respectfully referred to the Court for determination and as to
16 which no response is required.

17 **IV. PARTIES**

18 7. Responding to Paragraph 7 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Rite Aid
19 admits that Thrifty Payless, Inc. is a corporation, and that it leases and operates a retail
20 establishment on the subject property. Except as so admitted, Rite Aid denies, upon
21 information and belief, each and every allegation contained in Paragraph 7 of
22 Plaintiff's Complaint.

23 8. Rite Aid lacks sufficient knowledge or information to form a belief
24 as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 8 of Plaintiff's Complaint, and
25 on that basis, denies each and every allegation contained therein.

26 **V. FACTS**

27 9. Responding to Paragraph 9 of Plaintiff's Complaint, Rite Aid
28 admits that it is a lessee of a building at 1325 3rd Avenue, Chula Vista, California

1 91911, and that the building contains a retail establishment open to the public. Except
2 as so admitted, Rite Aid denies, upon information and belief, each and every
3 allegation contain in Paragraph 9 of Plaintiff's Complaint.

4 10. Rite Aid lacks sufficient knowledge or information to form a belief
5 as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 10 of Plaintiff's Complaint,
6 and on that basis, Rite Aid denies each and every allegation contained therein.

7 11. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
8 allegations of Paragraph 11 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies these
9 allegations.

10 12. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
11 allegations of Paragraph 12 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies these
12 allegations.

13 13. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
14 allegations of Paragraph 13 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies these
15 allegations.

16 14. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
17 allegations of Paragraph 14 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies these
18 allegations.

19 15. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
20 allegations of Paragraph 15 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies these
21 allegations.

22 **VI. FIRST CLAIM**

23 (Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990)

24 16. Rite Aid incorporates by reference each and every response to the
25 allegations contained in Paragraphs 1 through 15 of this Answer.

26 17. Paragraph 17 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
27 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
28 the Court for determination.

1 18. Rite Aid lacks sufficient knowledge or information to form a belief
2 as to the truth of the allegations contained in Paragraph 18 of Plaintiff's Complaint,
3 and on that basis, denies each and every allegation contained therein.

4 Failure to Remove Architectural Barriers in an Existing Facility

5 19. Paragraph 19 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
6 contentions to which no response is required and which is specifically submitted to the
7 Court for determination.

8 20. Paragraph 20 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
9 contentions to which no response is required and which is specifically submitted to the
10 Court for determination.

11 21. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
12 allegations of Paragraph 21 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
13 allegations.

14 22. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
15 allegations of Paragraph 22 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
16 allegations.

17 Failure to Design and Construct an Accessible Facility

18 23. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
19 allegations of Paragraph 23 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
20 allegations.

21 24. Paragraph 24 of the Complaint consists of legal theories and
22 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
23 the Court for determination.

24 25. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
25 allegations of Paragraph 25 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
26 allegations.

27 Failure to Make an Altered Facility Accessible

28 26. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the

1 allegations of Paragraph 26 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
2 allegations.

3 27. Paragraph 27 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
4 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
5 the Court for determination.

6 28. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
7 allegations of Paragraph 28 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
8 allegations.

9 Failure to Modify Existing Policies and Procedures

10 29. Paragraph 29 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
11 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
12 the Court for determination.

13 30. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
14 allegations of Paragraph 30 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
15 allegations.

16 31. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
17 allegations of Paragraph 31 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
18 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

19 32. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
20 allegations of Paragraph 32 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
21 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

22 **VII. SECOND CLAIM**

23 (Disabled Persons Act)

24 33. Rite Aid incorporates by reference each and every response to the
25 allegations contained in Paragraphs 1 through 32 of this Answer.

26 34. Paragraph 34 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
27 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
28 the Court for determination.

1 35. Paragraph 35 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
2 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
3 the Court for determination.

4 36. Paragraph 36 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
5 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
6 the Court for determination.

7 37. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
8 allegations of Paragraph 37 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
9 allegations.

10 38. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
11 allegations of Paragraph 38 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
12 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

13 39. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
14 allegations of Paragraph 39 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
15 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

16 **VII. THIRD CLAIM**

17 (Unruh Civil Rights Act)

18 40. Rite Aid incorporates by reference each and every response to the
19 allegations contained in Paragraphs 1 through 39 of this Answer.

20 41. Paragraph 41 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
21 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
22 the Court for determination.

23 42. Paragraph 42 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
24 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
25 the Court for determination.

26 43. Paragraph 43 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
27 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
28 the Court for determination.

1 44. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
2 allegations of Paragraph 44 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
3 allegations.

4 45. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
5 allegations of Paragraph 45 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
6 allegations.

7 46. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
8 allegations of Paragraph 46 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
9 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

10 47. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
11 allegations of Paragraph 47 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
12 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

13 **IX. FOURTH CLAIM**

14 (Denial of Full and Equal Access to Public Facilities)

15 48. Rite Aid incorporates by reference each and every response to the
16 allegations contained in Paragraphs 1 through 47 of this Answer.

17 49. Paragraph 49 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
18 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
19 the Court for determination.

20 50. Paragraph 50 of Plaintiff's Complaint consists of legal theories and
21 contentions to which no response is required and which is respectfully submitted to
22 the Court for determination.

23 51. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
24 allegations of Paragraph 51 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
25 allegations.

26 52. Rite Aid lacks sufficient information and belief to respond to the
27 allegations of Paragraph 52 of Plaintiff's Complaint and on that basis denies those
28 allegations. Rite Aid further denies that Plaintiff is entitled to the relief requested.

1 **WITHOUT ANY CONCESSION TO ANY CLAIM OR**
2 **ALLEGATION BY PLAINTIFF, RITE AID ASSERTS THE FOLLOWING**
3 **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES TO PLAINTIFF'S COMPLAINT AND EACH**
4 **PURPORTED CAUSE OF ACTION THEREIN:**

5 **FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

6 (Failure to State a Claim)

7 53. As a first affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon
8 information and belief, that Plaintiff's Complaint, and each purported cause of action
9 therein, fails to state facts sufficient to constitute a claim.

10 **SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

11 (Statute of Limitations)

12 54. As a second affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon
13 information and belief, that Plaintiff's Complaint, and each of its claims, is barred by
14 the applicable statute of limitations.

15 **THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

16 (Failure to Mitigate)

17 55. As a third affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon information
18 and belief that, without admitting that Plaintiff has suffered any injury or damage
19 whatsoever, Plaintiff has failed to mitigate his damages.

20 **FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

21 (Laches)

22 56. As a fourth affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon information
23 and belief, that Plaintiff's Complaint, and each of its causes of action, is barred due to
24 the equitable doctrine of laches.

25 **FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

26 (No Discrimination)

27 57. As a fifth affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon information
28 and belief, that it is not liable to Plaintiff for any alleged damages because Rite Aid

1 did not engage in any discriminatory actions as alleged in Plaintiff's Complaint.

2 **SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

3 (No Control of Common Areas)

4 58. As a sixth affirmative defense, Rite Aid alleges, upon information
5 and belief, that it is not liable to Plaintiff for any alleged damages because Rite Aid
6 did not manage or control the common areas and parking areas of the shopping center
7 which is the subject of Plaintiff's Complaint.

8 **SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

9 (Alterations Made Prior Enactment of ADA)

10 59. As a seventh affirmative defense, any alterations to the subject
11 facilities were made prior to the enactment of the Americans With Disabilities Act,
12 thus such alterations are not required to be remodeled to the maximum extent feasible
13 under section 303 of the ADA and section 54.1 of the California Civil Code, Unruh
14 Civil Rights Act.

15 **EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

16 (Facilities Built Prior To Enactment of the ADA)

17 60. As an eighth affirmative defense, the subject facilities were built
18 prior to the enactment of the Americans With Disabilities Act, therefore section 303 of
19 the ADA, and section 54.1 of the California Civil Code, Unruh Civil Rights Act,
20 requiring new construction to be accessible to the maximum extent feasible are not
21 applicable.

22 **NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

23 (Not Readily Achievable)

24 61. As a ninth affirmative defense, Rite Aid is only required under
25 section 302(b)(2)(A)(iv) of the ADA, and section 54.1 of the California Civil Code,
26 Unruh Civil Rights Act, to remove architectural barriers in their existing facilities if
27 such removal is "readily achievable". The barriers plaintiff refers to in his Complaint
28 cannot be removed under the "readily achievable" standard.

TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

(Others at Fault)

62. As a tenth affirmative defense to Plaintiff's Complaint and each and every cause of action alleged therein, Rite Aid alleges that all claims against Rite Aid are barred because obligations under the Complaint, if any, are obligations or breach of others for which Rite Aid is not responsible.

ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

(Issue Preclusion/Claim Preclusion)

63. As an eleventh affirmative defense to Plaintiff's Complaint and to each and every cause of action alleged therein, Rite Aid alleges, on information and belief, that Plaintiff's claims are barred under the doctrines of issue preclusion and claim preclusion.

TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE

(Reservation of Rights)

64. As a twelfth affirmative defense, because Plaintiff's Complaint is couched in broad and conclusory terms, Rite Aid cannot fully anticipate all defenses that may be applicable to the within action. Accordingly, the right to assert additional defenses, if and to the extent that such defenses are applicable, is hereby reserved.

X. PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Rite Aid prays for judgment as follows:

1. That Plaintiff take nothing by reason of his Complaint and that judgment be rendered in favor of Rite Aid;
2. That no injunctive relief is necessary and therefore is not awarded by the Court;
3. That Rite Aid be awarded its costs of suit incurred in defense of this action;
4. That Rite Aid be awarded reasonable attorneys' fees, and;

//

1 5. For any other and further relief as the Court considers just and proper.
2

3 DATED: July 21, 2008

LURIE, ZEPEDA, SCHMALZ & HOGAN

4
5 By: /s/Wayne C. Arnold
6 Wayne C. Arnold
7 Attorneys for Defendant
8 THRIFTY PAYLESS, INC.
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

LURIE, ZEPEDA, SCHMALZ & HOGAN
9107 Wilshire Boulevard, Suite 800
Beverly Hills, California 90210-5533